MEDITERRANEAN PERSPECTIVES

Artistic and Cultural Dialogues in the Late Medieval Mediterranean

Edited by
María Marcos Cobaleda

palgrave
macmillan

Mediterranean Perspectives

Series Editors
Brian Catlos
University of Colorado - Boulder
Boulder, CO, USA

Sharon Kinoshita
University of California Santa Cruz
Santa Cruz, CA, USA

As a region whose history of connectivity can be documented over at least two and a half millennia, the Mediterranean has in recent years become the focus of innovative scholarship in a number of disciplines. In shifting focus away from histories of the origins and developments of phenomena predefined by national or religious borders, Mediterranean Studies opens vistas onto histories of contact, circulation and exchange in all their complexity while encouraging the reconceptualization of inter- and intra-disciplinary scholarship, making it one of the most exciting and dynamic fields in the humanities. Mediterranean Perspectives interprets the Mediterranean in the widest sense: the sea and the lands around it, as well as the European, Asian and African hinterlands connected to it by networks of culture, trade, politics, and religion. This series publishes monographs and edited collections that explore these new fields, from the span of Late Antiquity through Early Modernity to the contemporary.

More information about this series at
http://www.palgrave.com/gp/series/15161

María Marcos Cobaleda
Editor

Artistic and Cultural Dialogues in the Late Medieval Mediterranean

European Commission

Horizon 2020
European Union funding
for Research & Innovation

MARIE CURIE ACTIONS

ArtMedGIS
Project 699818-MSCA | H2020

FCT
Fundação para a Ciência e a Tecnologia
MINISTÉRIO DA CIÊNCIA, TECNOLOGIA E ENSINO SUPERIOR

palgrave
macmillan

Editor
María Marcos Cobaleda
University of Malaga
Malaga, Spain

Mediterranean Perspectives
ISBN 978-3-030-53365-6 ISBN 978-3-030-53366-3 (eBook)
https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-030-53366-3

© The Editor(s) (if applicable) and The Author(s), under exclusive licence to Springer Nature Switzerland AG 2021
Chapter 2 is licensed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 International License (http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/). For further details see licence information in the chapter.
This work is subject to copyright. All rights are solely and exclusively licensed by the Publisher, whether the whole or part of the material is concerned, specifically the rights of translation, reprinting, reuse of illustrations, recitation, broadcasting, reproduction on microfilms or in any other physical way, and transmission or information storage and retrieval, electronic adaptation, computer software, or by similar or dissimilar methodology now known or hereafter developed.
The use of general descriptive names, registered names, trademarks, service marks, etc. in this publication does not imply, even in the absence of a specific statement, that such names are exempt from the relevant protective laws and regulations and therefore free for general use.
The publisher, the authors and the editors are safe to assume that the advice and information in this book are believed to be true and accurate at the date of publication. Neither the publisher nor the authors or the editors give a warranty, expressed or implied, with respect to the material contained herein or for any errors or omissions that may have been made. The publisher remains neutral with regard to jurisdictional claims in published maps and institutional affiliations.

Cover illustration: Melvyn Longhurst / Alamy Stock Photo

This Palgrave Macmillan imprint is published by the registered company Springer Nature Switzerland AG.
The registered company address is: Gewerbestrasse 11, 6330 Cham, Switzerland

Contents

Part I Al-Andalus Beyond al-Andalus: The Maghreb and the Mashriq 1

1 From the Islamic West to Cairo: Malikism, Ibn Tūmart, al-Ghazālī and al-Qāḍī ʻIyāḍ's Death 3
Javier Albarrán

2 The "Bestsellers" of al-Andalus 31
Maribel Fierro

3 *Spolia* and Classical Revivals in Legitimacy Discourses: From Cordoba to the Mamluk Mosques of Cairo 57
Susana Calvo Capilla

Part II Andalusi Legacy in Medieval Christian Art 79

4 Visual Traits of Otherness: Figurative Resources Used in the Depiction of Muslims in Mediterranean Romanesque Sculpture 81
Inés Monteira

5 Islamicate Goods in Gothic Halls: The *Nachleben* of Palma de Mallorca's Islamic Past 99
Doron Bauer

6 Granada and Castile in the Shared Context of the Islamic Art in the Late Medieval Mediterranean 117
Juan Carlos Ruiz Souza

Part III Andalusi Cultural Legacy in the Iberian Societies 141

7 In the Shadow of Toledo, Seville, and Granada: On the Historic Significance of Murcia for the Transmission of Islamic Knowledge in the Twelfth and Thirteenth Centuries 143
Michael A. Conrad

8 Islamic Legacy in Medieval Iberian Societies: Building Rules 163
Sandra M. G. Pinto

9 From *aḥbās* to *habices*: Continuity and Transformation of Pious Endowments after the Castilian Conquest of Nasrid Granada 189
Ana María Carballeira Debasa

Part IV Circulation of Cultural Goods in the Medieval Mediterranean 205

10 Siculo-Arabic, Andalusi and Fatimid Ivory Works: Iconographic Transfers and Visual Propaganda 207
Noelia Silva Santa-Cruz

11 Ornamental Transfers in Textile Production in Almohad and Nasrid Periods 223
Laura Rodríguez Peinado

12 Art and Science in al-Andalus and the Late Medieval Mediterranean Cultures: Almohad, Nasrid and Ayyubid Astrolabes in their Context 239
Azucena Hernández Pérez

Part V Final Remarks 253

13 Final Remarks: *ArtMedGIS* Project: Artistic Exchanges between East and West in the Late Medieval Mediterranean 255
María Marcos Cobaleda

Index 269

CHAPTER 4

Visual Traits of Otherness: Figurative Resources Used in the Depiction of Muslims in Mediterranean Romanesque Sculpture

Inés Monteira

The earliest images of Muslims recorded in Christian art in the West appear in the tenth century in the illuminated manuscripts known as *Beatus*, which are copies of the *Commentary on the Apocalypse* written by Beatus of Liébana. One of the most recognizable is the famous Islamic rider of the Girona Beatus (975, fol. 134v., Museu de la Catedral de Girona, no. inv. 7), studied by O. K. Werckmeister (1997, p. 10–16). The rider's dress, turban, and short stirrups are the same as those worn in al-Andalus in the tenth century and, as such, are reflected in caliphal art. Here the image takes on a negative connotation because it is almost identical to that of Herod in the same manuscript.[1] This codex was illuminated

[1] Herod appears in fol. 15v. Although Werckmeister's thesis has raised doubts about some concrete aspects such as the positive interpretation of the serpent, his work offers very solid

I. Monteira (✉)
Departamento de Historia del Arte, UNED (Universidad Nacional de Educación a Distancia), Madrid, Spain
e-mail: imonteira@geo.uned.es

© The Author(s) 2021

M. Marcos Cobaleda (ed.), *Artistic and Cultural Dialogues in the Late Medieval Mediterranean*, Mediterranean Perspectives,
https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-030-53366-3_4

in the monastery of San Salvador de Tábara (Zamora) by Christian monks who had fled from al-Andalus, which explains the polemical context of confrontation that is seen in this illustration as a reflection of the ideological climate surrounding them.

Nevertheless, the allusions to Islam in the Beatus manuscripts are, for the most part, indirect. A good example of this is the illustration of Belshazzar's Feast in Morgan Beatus (fol. 202v, The Pierpont Morgan Library, New York, MS 644), dating from the second-third of the tenth century, which has been studied by Williams and Dodds. The banquet scene is framed by a horseshoe arch with alternating red and white voussoirs like those in the Great Mosque of Cordoba. Thus, the comparison between ancient Babylonia and the Umayyad capital endows the biblical account with a contemporary political meaning (Williams 1980, p. 212–27; Dodds 1993, p. 33–34).

Other studies have uncovered references to Muslim power in that period, particularly in depictions of the Antichrist or the Apocalyptic Beast, in addition to several negative figures in the Old Testament (Sepúlveda 1979, p. 139–53; Stierlin 1983, p. 157; Dodds 1993, p. 27–37, Werckmeister 1997, p. 101–06; Williams 2004, p. 297–304; Franco 2007, p. 139–50). In this sense, the setting of certain scenes in the world of Muslim al-Andalus offers an updated reading of the biblical passages.[2] We also find the interpretation of the present as the fulfillment of the biblical prophecies in Spanish chronicles and other Latin texts of the period. In these works the Islamic conquest of Iberia is identified with the materialization of the apocalyptic signs, the Muslims are compared to the enemies of the Hebrews in the Old Testament and Muḥammad is the equivalent of the Antichrist (Flori 2007; Daniel 1993, p. 106–12).

Romanesque sculpture also contains a few metaphorical allusions to Muslims in the guise of biblical figures. This is the case of the famous image of Ismael with a turban in the Lamb tympanum of San Isidoro in León, so brilliantly analysed by John Williams as a reference to Islamic

arguments for the identification of this rider as an image of the Muslim "enemy" and, as such, his argument has been widely accepted by historians.

[2] An emblematic example is the depiction of the Whore of Babylon in various Beatus, where the female figure is seated cross-legged on a cushion and holds a cup similar to the way the caliph is represented in Andalusi art. Sometimes explicit details are added, such as the crescent moon on the crown of the figure, as in the Beatus of Fernando I, fol. 224v. See Sepúlveda (1979, p.140).

power in the peninsula at the beginning of the twelfth century (Williams 1977, p. 3–14).

We also find examples in Romanesque sculpture of specific images of Muslims which are unrelated to biblical parables. The rise of a profane iconography and scenes of combat in particular, enable us to state that it is in the twelfth century when the image of the Muslim takes on a more specific role in Western Christian art. The explanation for this iconographic phenomenon lies in the political context of the moment. In the second half of the eleventh century the popes began to promote the occupation of Islamic territory in the Iberian Peninsula and the Holy Land, and in order to do so, they developed an ideology of a holy war (Flori 2003; García-Fiz 2002). These military campaigns were perceived as acts of spiritual transcendence and, as such, their appearance was justified in the decoration of the temple. Even though several studies exist on the depiction of the Muslim in Romanesque sculpture, this field is open for further exploration and entails certain difficulties because of the symbolic nature of many of its representations (Lejeune and Stiennon 1971; Seidel 1981; Strickland 2003; Monteira 2012a). The Romanesque image cannot be read in a literal sense due to the fact that many of its forms are graphic transpositions of moral values and the transcendental messages they wish to convey. Because these figures of monsters and beasts often symbolize human vices, their animalization and deformation constitute artistic ways of expressing moral degradation in visual terms (Wirth 1999, p. 366). The metaphorical meaning of these images often hinders the identification of scenes and characters, particularly when they do not illustrate biblical passages. Moreover, the frequent deterioration of the stone makes the reliefs even more illegible.

In order to compensate for these limitations and progress in our interpretation of Romanesque art, it would be useful to analyse the representative guidelines that are repeated in different scenes. This procedure has enabled art historians to decipher the meaning of specific figurative resources. In this regard, some works on gestures in the art of the twelfth and thirteenth centuries have been very useful. Studies by Garnier and Schmitt start from the analysis of a significant number of images to deduce, for example, that the unstable attitude of the figures and their excessive gesticulation denote fiercely negative and demonic temperaments (Garnier 1982, p. 120–22; Schmitt 1990, p. 128–40). These same procedures can also be applied to images of Muslims.

In this study, we have brought together several examples of twelfth-century sculpture in France, Italy and Spain in which iconographic and compositional procedures in common are used to depict Muslims. This will enable us, on the one hand, to try to decipher the meaning of these iconographic solutions and, on the other hand, to further our knowledge of the representation of religious otherness in the art of Mediterranean Christendom in the central centuries of the Middle Ages.

In the façade of the church at Oloron-Sainte-Marie (French Pyrenees), we find two figures of "Saracen" captives chained together in the trumeau and holding the weight of the church on their shoulders like classical Atlas. These figures, dating between 1115 and 1135, wear short tunics with a pearled fringe bordering the edge of their skirts. Their heads are covered with striped turbans and they wear slightly pointed sandals, in keeping with the typical costume of Muslims of that period (Arié 1990, p. 91–120). They are joined at the waist and ankles by chains, while their bulging eyes and open mouths have been mutilated by human hands. Ruth Bartal has shown that they represent the defeated Muslim enemy, bent under the weight of the religious edifice and symbolically subjugated to the power of the faith (Bartal 1987, p. 103).

Sénac pointed out that these captives commemorate the success of the First Crusade, and, more specifically, the participation of Gaston IV, Viscount of Béarn, who was a patron of this church (Sénac 2000, p. 65–66). The Viscount was also involved in the Christian conquest of Saragossa a few years before the erection of this portal, in 1118. The military defeat of the Muslims was interpreted in religious terms as a sign of the superiority of Christianity, an idea that coincides perfectly with the image of the captives crushed under the weight of the temple.

Another figure in this portal also attracts our attention. Located on the upper right side is a figure of a victorious knight whose horse's hooves are trampling on a small gesticulating figure (see Fig. 4.1). The motif of the victorious rider is widespread in the French and Spanish Romanesque and has been interpreted in various ways by historians. Some have seen this figure as Constantine triumphant over the pagans, others as Charlemagne over the Muslims, and still others as a crusader, depending on the context (see Monteira 2012b). The interpretation of this motif in Spanish Romanesque art has also been linked with the figure of St. James as *Moorslayer* or, more generally, as an image of the *miles Christi* triumphing over Islam (Ruiz Maldonado 1986). In the specific case of the knight at Oloron-Sainte-Marie, it is probably a direct reference to victory over

Fig. 4.1 Victorious knight over a defeated Muslim, West portal of Sainte Marie Cathedral, Oloron-Sainte-Marie, Pyrenées Atlantiques, France, ca. 1115–1135. Photo: Inés Monteira

contemporary Muslims and, as such, it reinforces the message of the trumeau of the portal. The beard and gesture of the defeated figure, whose tongue is hanging out, are typical traits of the *Sarracens* in the art of this period, although not exclusive to them. In this case, however, it is the interpretive context that leads us to the identification.

A few representations of a figure dominated by a victorious knight are clearly recognizable as Muslim. This is the case of a relief in the cloister of the cathedral of Tudela (Navarra, Spain), where the cross on the knight's shield and the turban of the defeated figure leave no doubt as to its meaning (see Fig. 4.2). Most of the time, however, the enemy does not have any identifying attributes, and the rider can be interpreted in a generic sense in relation to the chivalrous ideals of the world of feudalism.[3]

Although the image of the victorious knight is less frequent in Italian Romanesque art, there are a few examples of the visual procedure of

[3] The example from Tudela has been identified as St. George on top of a Muslim or Sancho VII at the battle of Las Navas de Tolosa in 1212.

Fig. 4.2 Victorious knight defeating a Muslim. Museo de Tudela, cloister of the cathedral of Tudela, Navarra, beginning of the thirteenth century. Photo: Inés Monteira

placing one figure under another to symbolize the defeat of Islam. This can be seen in the famous Throne of Elia in the basilica of St. Nicholas in Bari, dating from 1098. The throne was commissioned by Pope Urban II, himself, when he came to Bari for a synod. Among the topics discussed was the First Crusade that was taking place at that time and had become a major project for this pope (Nees 1999, p. 773–82). The bishop's throne is held up by three slaves similar to the atlantes at Oloron-Sainte-Marie. Although each figure is different, the one in the middle stands out because he wears a short skirt or caftan reminiscent of those worn by the captives in Oloron's church in addition to shoes with pointed tips and a short cane or staff. A detailed study of the physiognomy of these figures by André Grabar concluded that they were North African slaves flanking a person of a higher rank, identified by his dress as an Arab or Seljuq Turk (Grabar 1954, p. 12). Although Grabar did not go into detail about the ideological implications of this iconography, other scholars have interpreted the throne within the context of Christian reaffirmation after the conquest of

Jerusalem by the crusaders in 1099, given that some of the expeditions sailed from the port of Bari (Verzár 1986, p. 290).

The presence of Muslim atlantes on the Bari Throne is not unique in southern Italian Romanesque art. At least one of the bearers underneath the tomb of Roger II of Sicily (d. 1154), in Palermo cathedral, appears to wear a turban and all of them wear short tunics. The sense of triumph over Islam that can be deduced from this figure is consistent with other works done for this Norman ruler such as his famous silk mantle.[4]

Both the defeated figures under the hoofs of the victorious knights and the Muslim atlantes of Oloron, Bari, and Palermo correspond to the same compositional pattern: a vertical type that transmits notions of inferiority, defeat, and submission by placing one figure under the weight of another which, in turn, embodies the idea of triumph or victory. This very old and universal representational scheme appears in the ancient art of the Middle East and is perpetuated in Imperial Rome.[5]

In the Christian world, the same compositional model has traditionally served to allude to the triumph of good over evil, as in the images of St. Michael and the devil and the Virgin and the serpent (Garnier 1982, p. 84, 85, 111). This representational procedure we have termed *the principle of verticality* has been widely applied throughout Christian iconography, and among its many contexts, it was successful in symbolically depicting the victory of Christianity over Islam. This is confirmed by the subsequent diffusion of the image of St. James the Moorslayer (*Santiago Matamoros*), which is directly governed by the principle of verticality. Although this iconography did not become completely defined until the fourteenth century, it is in debt to the depiction of the victorious Romanesque knight (Cabrillana 1999, p. 213).

The *principle of verticality*, then, is a compositional device of a generalized nature that transmits very effectively in visual terms the idea of a military and spiritual triumph over an enemy. In no way, however, does it serve as an indicator in itself of the existence of a message related to

[4] In which his conquests are symbolized by the figures of two lions trampling on several camels. The Mantle of Roger II, now in the Kunsthistorisches Museum in Vienna, was done between 1133 and 1134 in Palermo. See Ettinghausen and Harner (1964, p. 116–71).

[5] A good example can be found in Sassanid rock shelter art in the Valley of Naqw-i Rustan (Iran), where there is a relief of the Persian king Bahram II mounted on top of an enemy (before 293 CE). This iconography is usual in Roman art. At one time, the equestrian statue of Marcus Aurelius (153 CE) had a figure of the enemy beneath the horse; Musei Capitolini, Rome.

religious otherness. In the cases we have mentioned, it is the distinctive traits of the defeated figures themselves that allow us to identify them. These traits are mainly of two types: dress and physical characteristics. The short tunic or caftan, the turban or striped headdress, and the pointed slippers are some of the components typical of Andalusi, North African, and Near Eastern Islamic dress in the examples we have mentioned. In addition, facial features also make up an essential aspect of these identifications. As we have seen in the Bari Throne, André Grabar identified the two half-naked slaves as Africans, and more specifically as Ethiopians, particularly the one on the right, because of his curly hair arranged in ringlets (Grabar 1954, p. 12). Their broad nose and thick lips also identify them as Muslims coinciding, to a certain extent, with the ethnic type proper to North Africa and the Near East (Dorin 2008, p. 42–43).

The wide nose and thick lips are typical of the Muslims in illustrations of several early medieval French manuscripts, as well as the dark colour of their skin (Reynaud 1990, p. 151–53). These same traits are also taken up in written sources. In fact, in the epic poems, Muslims are described in the same way as sub-Saharan Blacks without differentiating between them. The black colour of their skin is a characteristic proper to some "Saracens" such as Abîme (Abyss) in the *Chanson de Roland* (end of the eleventh century), Fernagu in *Floovant* (twelfth century), Berruier in *Otinel* (twelfth century), Maubrun in *Fierabras* (ca. 1170), and Nabor in *L'Entrée d'Espagne* (beginning of the fourteenth century), where their skin is described in a series of comparisons as "blacker than pepper sauce," "blacker than ink," or "blacker than a raven."[6] In all probability, these works of oral transmission reflect the popular perception of Muslims, who are frequently categorized as Blacks. In the Spanish epic poem *Poema de Fernán González* (ca. 1255), the soldiers of Almanzor are compared to Satan because they are ugly, dirty, and black as coal.[7]

The majority of the images of Blacks that appear in Romanesque art on the exterior corbels of churches can be found in Spain. These Black heads

[6] In *La Chanson d'Aspremont* a contingent of Turks has skin "blacker than ink" (1970, vv. 9806–9811, p. 118) and *Fierebras* (1966, v. 3085). Abîme in *La Chanson de Roland* (2003, v. 1634, p. 175); Ferragu in *Floovant* (1966, v. 390, p. 13); Berruier in *Otinel* (1966, vv. 926–927, p. 36) and Nabor in *L'Entrée d'Espagne* (1888, v. 7293, vol. 1, p. 266). It is also significant that in some epic poems the Christians pass for Muslims by painting their skin black; see Bancourt (1982, vol. 1, p. 68–69).

[7] "Mas feos que Satan con todo su convento, / quando sal del infyerno suzio e carv[o]niento"; *Poema de Fernán González* (1973), xvi, p. 73.

often appear characterized by gestures and combine all the traits associated with Africans: a broad nose, thick lips, and curly hair (See Monteira 2009). Undoubtedly, the polychromy that covered a considerable part of Romanesque sculpture of the time served to make these Black heads stand out and be more recognizable in the eyes of the faithful.

In Jean Devisse's encyclopaedic study of the image of Blacks in Western art, he points out the fact that Spanish art provides us with the earliest medieval images of Black Africans due to its contact with al-Andalus (Devisse 1979, p. 86–87). In addition to the increasing presence of Muslims of Black origin in the Iberian Peninsula in the eleventh century, the Andalusi armies fighting against the Christians enlarged their ranks with sub-Saharan slaves, who were much prized as warriors (García-Fitz 2002, p. 89). The propagation of heads of Blacks with very realistic features in the corbels of Romanesque churches testifies to the astonishment and curiosity that the presence of Blacks must have caused in the peoples of Northern Spain.

It has been pointed out that the rejection of Blacks in Western Europe was even greater than that of Muslims (Sachs 1969, p. 891). In the thirteenth century, however, the image of the Black begins to separate itself from that of Muslims in Spanish art. Now dark skin can also be associated with gentiles, in a broader sense of the word, with certain types of converts and, of course, with the devil (Patton 2016, p. 213–38). On the other hand, when the colour black is mentioned in relation to Muslims, it is interpreted as a defect, a sign of its crimes and moral perversion.[8] Thus, the insistence on the blackness of the skin of the "Saracens" is a mechanism of demonization that reinforces their evil nature (Bancourt 1982, p. 69–71).

Collective mental representations do not always coincide with reality. We know that the majority of the Muslims of al-Andalus were local inhabitants converted to Islam. Some Andalusi rulers were blonde, and there were many Slavic slaves in the service of the Islamic courts of the West (Ajello 1995, p. 257–68). Many Spanish Christians of the time were probably aware of this ethnic plurality among their southern neighbours. The image of the Muslim with the features of a Black in Romanesque sculpture

[8] The black colour is listed among the defects of the Saracens, as it is an indication of disloyalty, perversity, and a lack of faith. This can be seen in the description of Âbime in the *Chanson de Roland*, whose black skin is mentioned in a litany of defects (2003, vv. 1473–1476; vv. 1634–1639, p. 175).

would correspond, therefore, to a wilful intent to purposely accent the physical differences between Christians and Muslims. Thus, we are dealing with an ideological construct that sought to display the Muslim as the other in visual terms and clothe his image in negative connotations.

Those African Blacks who arrived in the peninsula in the twelfth century were even more rejected than the rest of the Andalusis, for they made up an otherness that was not only religious but also ethnic, cultural—more so than the native Muslims—and, in many cases, social, because of their condition as slaves. The pejorative nature of Black heads in the Spanish Romanesque is particularly evident in the church at Moarves de Ojeda (Palencia), whose façade contains a head with curly hair and Black features, in addition to the ears of a rabbit or donkey (Monteira 2012a, p. 482). This image goes one step further in the demonization of the figure of the Black by means of animalization. Here the coexistence of Black and beastly traits admits an absolute notion of otherness that, on a conceptual plane, resulting in "expelling" the figure not only from the Christian community (for the colour of its skin) but also from the human species (for its animalism).

The assimilation of the Black to the Muslim in Romanesque art and in epic literature corresponded to a mechanism of construction of the image of the Muslim based on his characterization as different, as otherness. With it, the artist sought to depict the most negative idea of his religious rival, the one that was most irreconcilable with Christianity. Anthropologists have identified this tendency to accentuate their differences with outsiders—even when they are not so notorious—as typical of Western societies. Moreover, there is also a propensity to minimize variations within the group with which they identify (Van Dijk 2003, p. 46). It is significant that Muslims who convert to Christianity in the epic poems are usually white and blonde, or their skin becomes miraculously whitened when they are baptized (Bancourt 1982, p. 56–58; Strickland 2003, p. 167). On the other hand, it is interesting to observe that the Christian ideal of beauty conforms to opposing parameters of the other: thin lips and white skin are synonymous with beauty in the Hispanic world of the time (Averkorn 2000, p. 27–44; Monteira 2012a, 483–84).

Muslims are also characterized by their black skin in panel painting and late Romanesque frescos (thirteenth century).[9] From these evidences we

[9] A significant example is the Saracen giant Ysoré, who is shown with dark skin and features, fighting against William of Orange in the thirteenth-century frescos at Tour Ferrande

can deduce that the loss of polychromy in the reliefs has, with the passage of time, deprived us of valuable information that would have enabled us to identify other figures marked by the dark colour of their skin.

But the Muslim is not always depicted in Romanesque sculpture with traits that denote his negative character or his defeat. In a capital in the outer window of Santa María del Rivero in San Esteban de Gormaz (Soria), there is an interesting horseman who is riding side-saddle and is led by a vassal (see Fig. 4.3). His caftan with wide sleeves and voluminous turban clearly identify him as a Muslim, while the parallel lines of his costume seem to evoke richly embroidered cloth. The stern expression on his face is similar to that of two other figures with identical dress but without horses on a nearby capital. The way he is seated on his horse and guided by a servant seems to indicate his high military or political rank; and his

Fig. 4.3 Muslim rider, capital in a north outer window of Santa María del Rivero in San Esteban de Gormaz (Soria). Beginning of the twelfth century. Photo: Inés Monteira

(Curzi 2007, p. 432–47). Another outstanding example is the *Viga de la Pasión* (Passion Beam), in which Christ's executioners appear as Black Muslims with their typical turbans ending in two parts; Museo Nacional de Arte de Cataluña (ca. 1200), inv. 015833.000.

majestic demeanor, without strident gestures, is in keeping with positive values within Romanesque sculpture (Garnier 1982, p. 121). The prominent belt or girdle on his caftan, with a kind of knot in the centre, is a further indication of his importance. The belt symbolizing power is associated with the depictions of rulers in Asiatic cultures and, in turn, inherited by Eastern Islam (Roux 1995, p. 196).

A closer look at the central motif on the belt reveals a human head with similar characteristics to those of its bearer. This may be a trophy-head alluding to the widespread practice of exhibiting the heads of enemies defeated in battle. During this period, Muslims frequently exhibited and hung the heads of rivals or defeated Christians from the top of their walls (Fierro 2008, p. 137–64). The Christian Kingdoms also adopted this practice to the extent that they hung the mutilated heads of Muslims at the doors of their churches.[10] In effect, San Esteban de Gormaz was Islamic until it was conquered definitively by the Christians in the middle of the eleventh century, after more than a century of bitterly fought battles. Construction of this church was begun shortly after the conquest at the end of the eleventh century and the presence of several figures with turbans on its capitals reflects this context of coexistence and conflict.

This equestrian figure might be interpreted as a brave Muslim leader who had probably triumphed over the Christians. In the epic poems we find references to Muslim generals who hung the heads of their vanquished enemies from their saddles as a sign of their great cruelty (Bancourt 1982, p. 178). Nevertheless, the absence of explicitly pejorative elements in this figure points to the sculptor's wish to present him as a brave and fearsome adversary. In the Spanish and French chronicles of the time, however, it is more common to find references to Muslim cowardice, which is described as proverbial, in contrast to Christian valour (Barkai 1984, p. 158–59, 243). But when it comes to narrating the battle itself, Muslim cowardice is transformed into ferocity and the enemy becomes a fearsome warrior, which makes the Christian victory an even greater triumph (Munro 1931, p. 329–43). This may be the possible meaning of the figure in Santa María del Rivero, where the will to show Muslim power refers back to those who had governed San Esteban de Gormaz in former times.

In the comparative analysis of the case studies presented here, we have tried to disseminate a few artistic procedures that may serve to aid in the

[10] As recorded in the *Crónica del Emperador Alfonso VII* (1997), Libro II, 71 (166), 72 (167), 75 (170), 79 (174), p. 117–19.

depiction of the Muslim in the twelfth century. We have shown how certain resources such as *the principle of verticality* are used in different places in Southern Romanesque art to symbolize the defeat of Islam and that Muslims are characterized by a few ethnic traits and a particular type of dress. The identification of these procedures can be very useful in developing some instruments of analysis that will enable us to delve deeper into the study of the visual construction of religious otherness in the twelfth century.

Many studies have already confirmed the existence of a few common iconographic keys in Romanesque art on a European scale. They have shown that both those who were responsible for the ideologies of the sculptural programs and the faithful who were recipients of those programs were familiar with them as well. This can be explained by the existence of so-called artists' notebooks that enabled a few similar figurative themes to be spread throughout different regions under the close supervision of the Church (Stratford 2006, p. 7–20). At the same time, however, each example we have analysed is linked to the specific context of each building and its patrons. Moreover, the *principle of verticality* also had a more universal application because it represented the victory over evil and the devil as well as over certain collectives—not necessarily Muslim—that were condemned by ecclesiastic moral authority. Finally, the image of Blacks began to encompass a wider semantic spectrum beginning in the twelfth century, thanks to the missions undertaken by the mendicant orders and the knowledge of distant lands learned from travellers in the late Middle Ages.[11] Although everything points to the fact that the Black in twelfth-century Western Christian art was assimilated into Islam, we should not overlook the fact that some of these images allude only to otherness or to the devil. This is why the definition of the meaning of the figurative procedures we have studied should not be taken too literally. It is always necessary to give priority to their immediate context in interpreting these works. Moreover, the characteristics of Muslims in Romanesque art are not necessarily applicable in later periods, given the changes in dress and European contact with other peoples.[12]

[11] These figures do not necessarily represent an Islamic otherness. It is only in the fifteenth century, with the appearance of the Black king of the Three Wise Men, that we begin to see images of Blacks with the purpose of converting them to Christianity (Devisse 1979, part II, vol. 1, p. 161).

[12] In the fifteenth century, for example, the turban became fashionable in several parts of Europe. Furthermore, travellers and expeditions to Africa, Asia, and later on, to the Americas, revealed the existence of a multitude of non-Christian peoples and ethnic groups who were also non-Muslim.

On the other hand, examples like the ones in Santa María del Rivero (Gormaz) show the existence of other patterns applied to the image of the Muslim and evidence of a rich repertoire yet to be explored. This is due to the fact that the representation of religious otherness was not completely codified in the eleventh and twelfth centuries because it was still in its initial stages. We must wait until the late Gothic to see the visual stereotypes of Muslims fully defined, when the realistic nature of art made these forms more explicit (Strickland 2003). However, it is in the twelfth century when the image of the Muslim begins to take shape and divests itself, to a large extent, of biblical allusions and deals with contemporary reality.

References

Ajello, Anna. 1995. La Connaissance de l'Islam dans le mouvement franciscain (XIIIème siècle- début XIVème siècle. In *L'Occident Musulman et l'Occident Chrétien au Moyen Âge*. «Série Collèges et séminaires», vol. 48, 257–268. Rabat: Faculté des Lettres et des Sciences Humaines.

Arias, Monteira, and Inés. 2012a. *El enemigo imaginado. La escultura románica hispana y la lucha contra el Islam (siglos XI a XIII)*. Toulouse: Méridiennes CNRS.

———. 2012b. El triunfo sobre la idolatría como victoria sobre el Islam: Nuevas consideraciones sobre el caballero victorioso en el románico hispano. *Espacio, Tiempo y Forma Serie VII. Historia del Arte* 25: 39–66.

Arié, Rachel. 1990. Quelques remarques sur le costume des Musulmans d'Espagne au temps des Nasrides. In *Etudes sur la civilisation Musulmane*, 91–120. Leiden: Brill.

Averkorn, Raphaela. 2000. Les Nobles, sont-ils toujours beaux? Quelques remarques sur les descriptions de personnages dans les chroniques médiévales de la péninsule ibérique. In *Le Beau et le Laid au Moyen Age, «Senefiance»*, vol. 43, 27–44. Aix-en-Provence: CUERMA Université de Provence.

Bancourt, Paul. 1982. *Les Musulmans dans les Chansons de Geste du Cycle du Roi*, vols. II. Marseille: Université de Provence.

Barkai, Ron. 1984. *Cristianos y musulmanes en la España medieval (El enemigo en el espejo)*. Madrid: Rialp.

Bartal, Ruth. 1987. Le programme iconographique du portail occidental de Sainte-Marie d'Oloron et son contexte historique. *Les Cahiers de Saint Michel de Cuxa* 18: 95–113.

Cabrillana Ciézar, Nicolás. 1999. *Santiago Matamoros, historia e imagen*. Málaga: Diputación de Málaga.

Carleton Munro, Dana. 1931. The Western Attitude Toward Islam During the Period of the Crusades. *Speculum* 3 (VI): 329–343.

Crónica del Emperador Alfonso VII. 1997. Edited by M. Pérez González. León: Universidad de León.
Curzi, Gaetano. 2007. *Le pitture della Tour Ferrrande a Pernes-les-Fontaines: la legittimazione del potere*, in *Medioevo: la chiesa e il palazzo*. Edited by A. C. Quintavall, 432–47. Milan: Centro di Studi Medievali, Università degli Studi di Parma; Fondazione Cariparma, Electa.
Daniel, Norman. 1993. *Islam et Occident*. Paris: Les Éditions du Cerf.
Devisse, Jean. 1979. *L'image du Noir dans l'Art Occidental. II. Des premiers siècles Chrétiens aux "Grandes Déscovertes"*. Vol I, Part. II, Paris-Freiburg: Bibliothèque des Arts. New English Edition: D. Bindman and H. L. Gates (eds.). 2010. *The image of the Black in Western Art. From The Early Christian Era to the "Age of Discovery."* Vol. II, Part I. Massachusetts and London: Harvard University Press.
Dodds, Jerrilynn D. 1993. Islam, Christianity and the problem of Religious Art. In *The Art of Medieval Spain. a. D. 500–1200*, 27–37. New York: The Metropolitan Museum of Art.
Dorin, Rowan W. 2008. The Mystery of the Marble Man and His Hat: A Reconsideration of the Bari Episcopal Throne. *Florilegium* 25: 29–52.
Ettinghausen, R., and W. Hartner. 1964. The Conquering Lion, the Life of a Symbol. *Oriens* 17: 161–171.
Fierro, Maribel. 2008. Decapitation of Christians and Muslims in the Medieval Iberian Peninsula: Narratives, Images, Contemporary Perceptions. *Comparative Literature Studies* 45 (2): 137–164.
Flori, Jean. 2003. *La guerra santa. La formación de la idea de cruzada en el Occidente cristiano*. Madrid: Trotta-Universidad de Granada.
———. 2007. *L'Islam et la Fin des Temps. L'interprétation prophétique des invasions musulmanes dans la chrétienté médiévale*. Seuil: Lonrai.
Franco Mata, Ángela. 2007. La Diáspora de los apóstoles y relaciones de los Beatos con el Islam. In *XXV Ruta Cicloturística del Románico-Internacional*, 139–150. Pontevedra: Fundación cultural Rutas del Románico.
García-Fitz, Francisco. 2002. *Relaciones políticas y guerra. La experiencia castellano-leonesa frente al Islam. Siglos XI-XIII*. Sevilla: Universidad de Sevilla.
Garnier, François. 1982. *Le langage de l'image au Moyen Âge. Signification et Symbologie*. Paris: Le léopard d'Or.
Grabar, André. 1954. Trônes épiscopaux du XIème et XIIème siècle en Italie méridionale. *Wallraf-Richartz-Jahrbuch* 16: 7–52.
L'Entrée d'Espagne. Chanson de Geste Franco-Italienne. 1888. Edited by Antoine Thomas. Paris: Fermin Diderot.
La Chanson d'Aspremont. Chanson de Geste du XIIe siècle. 1970. Edited by L. Brandin, II Vol. Paris: Librairie Honoré Champion.
La Chanson de Roland. 2003. Edited by C. Segre. Paris: Droz.
Lejeune, Rita, and Jacques Stiennon. 1971. *The Legend of Roland in the Middle Ages*. Vol. II. London: Phaidon.

Les Anciens Poètes de la France. Fierabras. 1966. Edited by M. F. Guessard. Liechtenstein: Kraus Reprint.

Les Anciens Poètes de la France. Floovant. 1966. Edited by M. F. Guessard. Liechtenstein: Kraus Reprint.

Les Anciens Poètes de la France. Otinel. 1966. Edited by M. F. Guessard. Liechtenstein: Kraus Reprint.

Monteira Arias, Inés. 2009. Destierro físico, destierro espiritual. Los símbolos de triunfo sobre el infiel en los espacios secundarios del templo románico: las cabezas cortadas. In *Relegados al Margen. Marginalidad y espacios marginales en la cultura medieval*, ed. I. Monteira, A. Muñoz, and F. Villaseñor, 129–142. Madrid: CSIC.

———. *2012a. El enemigo imaginado. La escultura románica hispana y la lucha contra el Islam (siglos XI a XIII), Toulouse: Méridiennes CNRS.*

———. *2012b. "El triunfo sobre la idolatría como victoria sobre el Islam: Nuevas consideraciones sobre el caballero victorioso en el románico hispano", Espacio, Tiempo y Forma Serie VII. Historia del Arte, n. 25, pp. 39–66.*

Nees, Lawrence. 1999. Forging Monumental Memories in the Early Twelfth Century. In *Memory & Oblivion, Proceedings of the XXIX*[th] *International Congress of the History of Art held in Amsterdam, 1–7 September 1996*, ed. A.W. Reinink and J. Stumpel, 773–782. Amsterdam: Springer.

Patton, Pamela. 2016. An Ethiopian-Headed Serpent in the Cantigas de Santa María: Sin, Sex, and Color in Late Medieval Castile. *Gesta* 55: 213–238.

Poema de Fernán González. 1973. Madrid: Espasa-Calpe.

Raynaud, Christianne. 1990. *La violence au Moyen Âge XIII*[e]*-XV*[e] *siècle. D'après les livres d'histoire en Français*. Paris: Le Léopard d'Or.

Roux, Jean-Pierre. 1995. *Le Roi. Mythes et symboles*. Paris: Fayard.

Ruiz Maldonado, Margarita. 1986. *El caballero en la escultura románica de Castilla y León*. Salamanca: Universidad de Salamanca.

Sachs, Ignacy. 1969. L'image du noir dans l'art européen. *Annales Économies, Sociétés, Civilisations* 24: 883–893.

Schmitt, Jean-Claude. 1990. *La Raison des Gestes dans l'Occident médiéval*. Paris: Gallimard.

Seidel, Linda. 1981. *Songs of Glory. The Romanesque Façades of Aquitaine*. London and Chicago: University of Chicago.

Sénac, Philippe. 2000. *L'Occident médiéval face à l'Islam. L'image de l'autre*. Paris: Flammarion.

Sepúlveda, Mª. Ángeles. 1979. Una iconografía abasí en las miniaturas de los Beatos mozárabes. In *Arte y Cultura Mozárabe. Ponencias y comunicaciones presentadas al I Congreso Internacional de Estudios Mozárabes*, 139–153. Toledo: Instituto de Estudios Visigótico-Mozárabes de San Eugenio.

Stierlin, Henri. 1983. *Los Beatos de Liébana y el Arte Mozárabe*. Madrid: Editorial Nacional.

Stratford, Neil. 2006. Le problème des cahiers de modèles à l'époque Romane. *Cahiers de Saint-Michel de Cuxa* 37: 7–20.

Strickland, Debora Higgs. 2003. *Saracens, Demons & Jews. Making Monsters in Medieval Art*. Princeton: Princeton University Press.

Van Dijk, Teun A. 2003. *Racismo y discurso de las élites*. Barcelona: Gedisa.

Verzár Bornstein, Christine. 1986. Romanesque Sculpture in Southern Italy and Islam: A Revaluation. In *The Meeting of Two Worlds. Cultural Exchange Between East and West During the Period of the Crusades*, ed. V.P. Goss and Ch. Verzár, 285–293. Michigan: Western Michigan University, Kalamazoo.

Werckmeister, Otto Karl. 1997. The Islamic Rider in the Beatus od Girona. *Gesta* 36 (2): 101–106.

Williams, John. 1977. Generationes Abrahae: Reconquest Iconography in Leon. *Gesta* 16 (2): 3–14.

———. 1980. The Beatus Comentaries and Spanish Bible Illustration. In *Actas del Simposio para el estudio de los Códices del "Comentario al Apocalipsis" de Beato de Liébana*, vol. I, 212–227. Madrid: Joyas bibliográficas.

———. 2004. Los Beatos and the Reconquista. In *Patrimonio artístico de Galicia y otros estudios. Homenaje al Prof. Dr. Serafín Moralejo Álvarez*, ed. Ángela Franco Mata, vol. III, 297–302. Xunta de Galicia: Santiago de Compostela.

Wirth, Jean. 1999. *L'image à l'époque romane*. Paris: Les éditions du Cerf.