



ESPACIO, TIEMPO Y FORMA 4

AÑO 2016
NUEVA ÉPOCA
ISSN 1130-4715
E-ISSN 2340-1478

SERIE VII HISTORIA DEL ARTE
REVISTA DE LA FACULTAD DE GEOGRAFÍA E HISTORIA

UNED



ESPACIO, TIEMPO Y FORMA

AÑO 2016
NUEVA ÉPOCA
ISSN 1130-4715
E-ISSN 2340-1478

4

SERIE VII HISTORIA DEL ARTE
REVISTA DE LA FACULTAD DE GEOGRAFÍA E HISTORIA

DOI: <http://dx.doi.org/10.5944/etfvii.4.2016>



UNIVERSIDAD NACIONAL DE EDUCACIÓN A DISTANCIA

La revista *Espacio, Tiempo y Forma* (siglas recomendadas: ETF), de la Facultad de Geografía e Historia de la UNED, que inició su publicación el año 1988, está organizada de la siguiente forma:

- SERIE I — Prehistoria y Arqueología
- SERIE II — Historia Antigua
- SERIE III — Historia Medieval
- SERIE IV — Historia Moderna
- SERIE V — Historia Contemporánea
- SERIE VI — Geografía
- SERIE VII — Historia del Arte

Excepcionalmente, algunos volúmenes del año 1988 atienden a la siguiente numeración:

- N.º 1 — Historia Contemporánea
- N.º 2 — Historia del Arte
- N.º 3 — Geografía
- N.º 4 — Historia Moderna

ETF no se solidariza necesariamente con las opiniones expresadas por los autores.

UNIVERSIDAD NACIONAL DE EDUCACIÓN A DISTANCIA
Madrid, 2016

SERIE VII · HISTORIA DEL ARTE (NUEVA ÉPOCA) N.º 4, 2016

ISSN 1130-4715 · E-ISSN 2340-1478

DEPÓSITO LEGAL
M-21.037-1988

URL
ETF VII · HISTORIA DEL ARTE · <http://revistas.uned.es/index.php/ETFVII>

DISEÑO Y COMPOSICIÓN
Carmen Chincoa Gallardo · <http://www.laurisilva.net>

Impreso en España · Printed in Spain



Esta obra está bajo una licencia Creative Commons
Reconocimiento-NoComercial 4.0 Internacional.

DOSSIER

ART MOVES: PERFORMATIVITY IN TIME, SPACE AND FORM

by Mieke Bal

EL ARTE (SE) MUEVE: PERFORMATIVIDAD EN EL TIEMPO, EL ESPACIO Y LA FORMA

por Mieke Bal

DOSSIER

BEING PART OF IT: AFFECT AND THE BODY

AFFECTIVE RESONANCE: THE MOVING POTENTIAL OF MUSIC IN GILBERTO GIL'S «AQUELE ABRAÇO»

RESONANCIA AFECTIVA: EL POTENCIAL DINÁMICO DE LA MÚSICA EN «AQUELE ABRAÇO» DE GILBERTO GIL

Jeffrey Manoel Pijpers¹

Received: 29/10/2015 · Approved: 06/03/2016

DOI: <http://dx.doi.org/10.5944/etfvii.4.2016.15501>

Abstract

In this article I propose to conceive music as a sonic object that, different from visual art forms, has its own ways of moving through time and space. Through the analysis of the song «Aquele abraço», written in 1969 by the Brazilian musician and performer Gilberto Gil, I will focus on how he narrates an experience, which, I argue, is affectively diasporic. This means that the sense of alienation from the homeland is not exclusively related to a physical separation, but also to the affective induction of this experience. Departing from the notions of Brian Massumi and those of Gilles Deleuze and Félix Guattari about the nature and the experience of affect, I will explore how affect also emerges as an intensity circulating between bodies, which I relate to resonance and harmonic musical representation. This allows me to reflect on the dwelling in multiple worlds that is presented in the song's narration, as well as on its layering of performative characteristics that interact with the listener on an affective level.

Keywords

Affect; resonance; diaspora; censorship; sonic object; Gilberto Gil.

Resumen

En este artículo propongo la música como objeto sónico que, a diferencia de las artes visuales, tiene maneras propias de moverse a través del tiempo y del espacio. Mediante el análisis de la canción «Aquele abraço,» escrita en 1969 por el cantautor Brasileño Gilberto Gil, prestaré atención a su manera de narrar una experiencia que, sostengo, es afectivamente diaspórica. Esto significa que el sentimiento de alienación con respecto a la patria no se debe exclusivamente a una separación física, sino también a la inducción afectiva de esa experiencia. Partiendo de las nociones

1. ASCA, Amsterdam University (jeffreymanoel@gmail.com).

de Brian Massumi y las de Gilles Deleuze y Félix Guattari sobre la naturaleza y la experiencia afectiva, exploraré cómo lo afectivo también emerge como intensidad que circula entre cuerpos, relacionándolo con la resonancia y la representación armónico-musical. Esto me permite reflexionar sobre la experiencia, expresada en el nivel la narración, de estar presente en diferentes mundos a la vez, y cómo la multiplicación de características performativas interactúan con el oyente en el nivel afectivo.

Palabras clave

Afecto; resonancia; diáspora; censura; objeto sónico; Gilberto Gil.

INTRODUCTION

How to consider movement through time and space when it concerns music, which, in contrast to visual art forms, operates primarily on the level of the sonic? A song or a musical composition can move through time as it is performed and re-interpreted in different temporal settings, while at the same time its temporal movement can also allude to rhythm and to the progression of melodic structures. Music's movement through space can consist of the relation between a song or musical style and a geographical or cultural location – for example, grunge from industrialized Seattle, rancheros from rural Mexico, gangster rap from marginalized suburbs in big US cities – or of its appropriation in a different stylistic, cultural or socio-political context. But music also literally moves through space in the form of invisible, multidirectional sound waves. Ultimately, music can move its listeners by stirring their emotions, but it can also operate directly on the body, inducing the listener's desire to dance or to move along to a certain melody or rhythm. Music therefore functions according to simultaneous but contrasting dynamics that fluctuate between structure and convention on the one hand, and association and disruption on the other. The progression through a song, as well as the displacement of sound waves through space is linear, whereas a song's re-interpretation and the emotional response of the listener is based on lateral shifts through time and space, creating nonlinear connections, mediated by memory.

Translated to the context of late 1960s and early 1970s Brazil, when the military dictatorship imposed strict censorship on all artistic forms of expression, music had to reinforce a pre-defined image of Brazilian culture that was closely related to the geographical space of Brazil as a nation. The state authorities, after the military coup of 1964, promoted cultural expressions that emphasized Brazil's modernity and its insertion in the global economy, using mass media channels to spread an image of a harmonious and modern Brazilian identity.² This identity was closely related to the carnival celebration as it was being invented during the Vargas era and as we still know it today.³ Resisting this limited perspective of Brazilian culture, the *Tropicália* movement, with Caetano Veloso and Gilberto Gil as its most famous members, used music as a vehicle to show the richness of Brazilian cultural heritage as well as the foreign influences that were also part of daily reality. They drew on *Concretista* poetry – where form and content merged in such a way that the visual representation of a poem reflected its textual message – as well as on the rhythms and melodies of folk songs from the rural *Nordeste*, Brazil's poorest state. They

2. TREECE, David; González, Mike: *The Gathering of Voices*. London & New York, Verso, 1992, p. 314.

3. DO COUTO, Bruno Gontyjo: «Em busca de uma modernidade nacional: o movimento modernista e o projeto político-cultural do regime Vargas.» *Latitude* 9.1 (2015), pp. 131 - 168. (160). Under the rule of Getúlio Vargas, between the 1930s and the 1950s, samba was promoted as the official national music that, through the «ritual» of carnival, symbolized the mix of African, Indigenous and Portuguese cultures that had resulted in the new Brazilian identity. Samba-schools, or *blocos*, were given the role of relating Brazilian history through thematic representations that were performed in the samba processions. For further reading on how this folkloric and incomplete representation of a Brazilian culture for the promotion of the country's modernization was contested through poetry, see TREECE, David; González, Mike: *The Gathering of Voices*. London & New York, Verso, 1992.

returned to the legacy of the *bossa nova* tradition just as much as they integrated foreign rock characteristics that echoed the Beatles.⁴ According to the censors, the image of Brazilian modernity and progress, based on a clearly defined cultural heritage, was being jeopardized by this musical «contamination» with primitive elements and foreign influences.⁵ In this conflict between censors and *Tropicalistas*, the censor's effort to establish a clear separation between inside and outside – of the nation, of legitimized discourse – is subverted by the esthetic standards of the musicians because they do not abide by the same rules of separation.

An experience that parallels the blurring of the inside-outside dichotomy is diaspora. Due to the import of African slaves from shortly after Brazil's colonization until the end of the 19th century, the African diasporic experience is strongly intertwined with Brazilian cultural identity until the present day. Not only because African slave descendants experience a separation from their ancestors' continent of origin, but in the sense of a Brazilian culture that is profoundly alien from the definition of the nation provided by hegemonic discourse, due to its intertwinement with Portuguese colonization, African slave trade and dispossession of its original inhabitants. The Latin American homeland is therefore alien to itself. But the alienation also works in the opposite direction. According to Stuart Hall, a Latin American – or, in this case Brazilian – consciousness of one's cultural descent from Africa is no longer related to Africa as a continent, as a physical place to which a return is possible in order to recuperate the loss of the homeland. Since the deportation of African slaves to Latin America «[...] the original 'Africa' is no longer there. It too has been transformed. History is, in that sense, irreversible.»⁶ Diaspora in the Brazilian context can therefore be characterized by the mutual impingement of both sides of the inside-outside dichotomy of nationalist thought. African diaspora in Brazil is not only about a lack but also about a prominent imaginative – not imaginary – presence of Africa in Brazilian culture.

In a similar manner, the use of foreign musical influences by the *Tropicalistas* as a way of redefining Brazilian musical identity suggests that this identity can be defined by its capacity to dialogue with an external world instead of being perceived as influenced by it in a unidirectional way. Significantly, Paul Gilroy's approach to the African diaspora in *The Black Atlantic* frequently uses musical examples to show how stylistic influences on both sides of the Atlantic are involved in an affective exchange that works in both directions. Important to emphasize is that this affective character of the diasporic experience does not exclusively apply to African inheritance or historical consciousness. When most of the *Tropicalistas* were forced to leave the country after being convicted of subversive activities, their absence created a sense of alienation for the ones who stayed in the homeland. Their diasporic experience thus also affected the ones at home, becoming part of what these people experienced as their Brazilian identity.

4. CAMBRAIA NAVES, Santuza: *Da Bossa Nova à Tropicália*. Rio de Janeiro, Jorge Zahar, 2001, p. 47-49.

5. TREECE, David; González, Mike: *op. cit.* pp. 315-316.

6. HALL, Stuart: «Cultural identity and diaspora.» *Identity: Community, Culture, Difference*, London: Lawrence & Wishart (1990), pp. 222-237 (231).

Because diaspora in this context can be understood as an experience by which apparently separated bodies can touch each other in spite of the apparently obvious separations between them, I will use the concept of *affective diaspora*. The adjective «affective» refers to the space of intensity between bodies that not only allows one to cause a change in the other, but that also makes it possible to be acted upon (be affected) by other bodies. It is important to stress that «bodies» are «defined not by an outer skin-envelope or other surface boundary but by their potential to reciprocate or co-participate in the passages of affect.»⁷ The concept of affective diaspora thus refers to a diasporic experience that is passed on between bodies and that simultaneously defines the dynamics by which these bodies are no longer separated from one another. As such, the concept proposes a definition of cultural identity that is based on performative practices instead of geographical location.

Returning to the censorship that the musicians of the *Tropicália* movement faced, the expression of an affectively diasporic identity through music suggests a subversion of the dynamics through which censorship operates. Defining cultural and social norms and connecting them to a fixed national space can be likened to musical conventions regarding structure, style and melody. The circumvention of censorship by disrupting musical conventions therefore departs from the premise that a clear separation between an inside and outside territory does not exist. Music can make separated bodies touch each other – and does so through affect.

In the following analysis I will explore the affective dimension of the lyrics and the performance of Gilberto Gil's song «Aquele abraço» and how both relate to the Brazilian context described above. The song will be used to explore not only how affect operates in the performative dynamics between author and audience or listener(s), but also how it works through the lyrics, which evoke affect as they reflect on the affectively diasporic situation of the author and/or *the Sonic I*.⁸ In both Gilroy's and my own approach music is the vehicle for an affective exchange between cultures and countries, and between performer and perceiver. In accordance with this, Gilroy argues for a performance-oriented analysis which

[...] has a wider significance in the analysis of black cultural forms than has so far been supposed. Its strengths are evident when it is contrasted with approaches to black culture that have been premised exclusively on textuality and narrative rather than dramaturgy, enunciation, and gesture – the pre-and anti-discursive constituents of black metacommunication.⁹

Although I would contest Gilroy's description of aspects of performance such as dramaturgy, enunciation and gesture as pre- or anti-discursive, I do want to suggest that these forms of expression, which explicitly involve the body, put a stronger

7. GREGG, Melissa, and Gregory J. Seigworth (Eds.): *The affect theory reader*. Durham, Duke University Press, 2010, p. 2.

8. Instead of using the term of *the Lyric I* as often resorted to in poetry analysis, I prefer the use of *the Sonic I* as proposed by Cornelia Gräbner to refer to the narrative subject in poetry or music that is being performed and that, in turn, performs the lyrics in their corresponding melodic and rhythmic embedding. GRÄBNER, Cornelia: «Off the Page and Off the Stage: The Performance Poetry and its Public Function.» Diss. University of Amsterdam, 2007, pp. 198-200.

9. GILROY, Paul: *The Black Atlantic: Modernity and Double Consciousness*. London, Verso, 1993, p. 75.

emphasis on affective intensity than textual art and can therefore not exclusively be approached in terms of discourse analysis. When it comes to music in particular, the sonic dimensions, more than the lyrics, facilitate an affective stimulation of the listener's senses.

AFFECT, TRACING THE CONCEPT

Music's pivotal role in the (cultural) articulation of the African diaspora during the era of slave labour in Latin America and the Caribbean also relates to affective operations in a context of censorship and repression. Gilroy, in *The Black Atlantic*, mentions the preference of music over language and writing in the African legacy due to the fact that «the slaves' access to literacy was often denied on pain of death.» He furthermore refers to Edouard Glissant when he stresses the role of the body in forms of communication that work through dance and music.¹⁰ Glissant himself speaks about the «silent universe of the plantation» in the Caribbean context, in order to illustrate how, if there were forms of language through which songs and tales were orally expressed, a fragmentary and discontinuous format was required in order to disguise their content.¹¹ Translated to the context of the current analysis, the tradition of music in Brazil's diasporic and dictatorial history is rooted in a similar necessity to hide content from the censors by eschewing a logical structure while creating connections on the level of the affective.

Affect, as defined by Seigworth and Gregg in their introductory chapter to *The Affect Theory Reader*, constitutes «an impingement or extrusion of a momentary or sometimes more sustained state of relation as well as the passage [...] of forces or intensities.»¹² They explain intensities as «resonances that circulate about, between and sometimes stick to bodies.» Such resonances cannot be captured by «conscious knowing» but their fluctuation «can serve to drive us toward movement, toward thought and extension.» Affect thus refers to a body's capacity to act or to be acted upon, «to affect or be affected», but resides in the imminence of its movements and thoughts, not their concretization.¹³

Staying with the metaphor used by Seigworth and Gregg, the notion of resonance helps to see the connection between affect and music. Technically speaking, and as explained by Edward W. Large in his article «Resonating to Musical Rhythm,» in relation to music, resonance «refers to the response of an oscillation, exposed to a periodic stimulus, whose frequency stands in some particular relationship to

10. GILROY, Paul: *op. cit.* pp. 74-75.

11. GLISSANT, Edouard: «Creolization in the Making of the Americas.» *Caribbean Quarterly* (2008), pp. 81-89 (86). Although the quoted example mainly focuses on the imposed prohibition of the slaves' access to language, in accordance with the central focus of this analysis, it should be stressed here that music as a sonic form of communication on the plantation was also triggered by a need for expression in a multi-linguistic setting, caused by the difficulties of communication amongst slaves from different African linguistic regions.

12. GREGG, Melissa, and Gregory J. Seigworth (Eds.): *Op. Cit.* p. 1.

13. GREGG, Melissa, and Gregory J. Seigworth (Eds.): *Op. Cit.* pp. 1-2.

the oscillator's natural frequency.»¹⁴ This description can, for example, refer to a note that is transferred from one string to another, where the oscillation of one is being picked up by the other due to a relative proximity in frequency. The relation between strings that respond to each other's frequencies because of resonance is as that of bodies that, through affect, either act or are acted upon. Like resonance, affect causes a change in the other body. It is a phenomenon that can only be known by its effect (the resonating string), not by the medium of transference itself, which is situated in the in-between of the bodies in their relationship of affective proximity.

In his article «Affective Operations of Art and Literature», Ernst van Alphen stresses that affect as a concept is not to be confused with feelings or emotions, as these refer to the result of an affective exchange, a translation to a subjective experience that can be classified or put to words:

Although affects are social, that is, they are the result of an interactive process from without, the linguistic or visual content or thoughts attached to that affect belong to the person to whom the affect is transmitted.¹⁵

It is because of this non-subjective characteristic that inanimate objects such as artworks or literary texts are capable of working by means of affect. In this case, affect, just like resonance, exists only in the in-between of subject and object. Not directly tied to the particular emotion, or frequency, that it strums in the receptive subject, it is the space through which the affective transmission takes place and where the connection between subject and object exists on the basis of the event of this exchange.

In «The Autonomy of Affect», Brian Massumi recognizes this ungraspable nature of affect as a hurdle for «theories of signification that are wedded to structure [...]» and argues that, by focusing on, for example, linguistic or narratological structures, such approaches fail to capture «the expression event.»¹⁶ He later adds to this that «affect is unqualified. As such, it is not ownable or recognizable, and is thus resistant to critique,» which would suggest that affect, by nature, also resists analysis.¹⁷ Taking into account the passage from Van Alphen quoted above, an analysis of affect can therefore only focus on affect's results as it is translated into social or subjective experience – when, in other words, it becomes structured.

Massumi explains this by referring to Spinoza's philosophy of affect, in which the experience of an impingement of the body (affect) is accompanied by an unconscious idea of this impingement. Conscious reflection on the affect can only take place if there is «an idea of the idea of the affection.» He summarizes this as:

[...] the philosophy of the becoming-active, in parallel, of mind and body, from an origin in passion, in impingement, in so pure and productive a receptivity that it can only be conceived

14. LARGE, Edward W.: «Resonating to musical rhythm: theory and experiment.» *The psychology of time* (2008), pp. 189-232 (198).

15. ALPHEN, Ernst van: «Affective operations of art and literature.» *Res* 53 / 54 (2008), pp. 20-30 (24-25).

16. MASSUMI, Brian. «The autonomy of affect.» *Cultural Critique* (1995), pp. 83-109 (87-88).

17. MASSUMI, Brian. *op. cit.* p. 88.

as a third state, an excluded middle [...]: affect. This «origin» is never left behind, but doubles one like a shadow that is always almost perceived, and cannot but be perceived, in effect.¹⁸

Consequently, I will not talk about «affects» as countable and classifiable, but of affect as a singular noun, indicating a space of contact, event and movement.¹⁹ My analysis focuses on the effects of affect, whilst the objects of analysis can be the affected subject – including the subject performing the analysis – or the mechanisms by which the affective transmission takes place. In the close reading of Gilberto Gil's «Aquele abraço» on which I will now embark, the focus on affect requires an awareness of why and how certain affectively induced responses by the audience of the live event or by the listener of the recording can be observed or deduced. The lyrics of the song are represented below, where a first glance already gives an impression of the rhythmic and interjectory character of the song:

Aquele abraço That Embrace*

O Rio de Janeiro continua lindo	Rio de Janeiro is still beautiful
O Rio de Janeiro continua sendo	Rio de Janeiro continues to be
O Rio de Janeiro, fevereiro e março	Rio of January, February and March

Alô, alô, Realengo	Hello, hello, Realengo,
Aquele abraço	That embrace
Alô torçida do Flamengo	Hello stadium of Flamengo
Aquele abraço	That embrace

Chacrinha continua balançando a pança	Chacrinha is still wiggling his belly
E buzinando a moça e comandando a massa	And honking women and commanding the masses
E continua dando as ordens no terreiro	And still giving his orders in the country

Alô, alô, seu Chacrinha	Hello, hello, sir Chacrinha
Velho guerreiro	Old warrior
Alô, alô, Terezinha	Hello, hello, little Tereza
Rio de Janeiro	Rio de Janeiro

*GIL, Gilberto: «Aquele abraço.» Gilberto Gil. Rio de Janeiro, Philips Records, 1969. LP. My translation.

18. MASSUMI, Brian. *op. cit.* pp. 92-93.

19. By making this statement, I differ from theories that draw on the work of Silvan Tomkins, whose psychological work on affect was introduced in cultural theory by Eve Kosofsky Sedgwick and Adam Frank through their article «Shame in the Cybernetic Fold: Reading Silvan Tomkins.» They share and defend Tomkin's argument that (plural) affects, although experienced in the mind, are rooted in the body and can be analyzed and classified there. My decision to follow Deleuze and Massumi's definition of affect as a (singular) space of intensity, or, in my musical analysis, resonance, places affect in the space of transmission that can be either in the body, between bodies, between continents or even across chronological or diachronic time. The classifiable bodily aspects, in turn, are related to what Van Alphen called emotions or the effects of affect.

Alô, alô, seu Chacrinha Hello, hello, sir Chacrinha
 Velho palhaço Old clown
 Alô, alô, Terezinha Hello, hello little Tereza
 Aquele abraço That embrace

Alô moça da favela Hello girl from the suburbs
 Aquele abraço That embrace
 Todo mundo da Portela All of the samba school Portela
 Aquele abraço That embrace
 Todo mês de fevereiro All throughout February
 Aquele passo That procession
 Alô banda de Ipanema Hello band of Ipanema
 Aquele abraço That embrace

Meu caminho pelo mundo eu mesmo traço I draw my own travels around the world
 A Bahia já me deu régua e compasso Bahia already gave a ruler and a compass

Quem sabe de mim sou eu I am the one who knows about me
 Aquele abraço That embrace
 Prá você que me esqueceu To you who has forgotten me
 Aquele abraço That embrace
 Todo o povo brasileiro All Brazilians
 Aquele abraço That embrace

RESONANT BODIES

The first time Gil performed «Aquele abraço» live was at the concert in 1969 that was to pay for his flight to London. He and Caetano Veloso had been incarcerated for a month, after which the Brazilian military authorities ordered them to leave the country for an indefinite amount of time. They were allowed to organize a final concert to earn the money for their flight to London. Gil wrote «Aquele abraço» specifically for this concert as a way of saying goodbye to his country. The song is a salute of the Sonic I to Rio de Janeiro, with the city standing, *pars pro toto*, for the whole of Brazil, which Veloso explains in *Verdade Tropical*. Because the imminent departure of Gil and Veloso was not known to the public yet, and also because they did not want to provoke the authorities too much during this concert, the message of the song was disguised in such a way that, for the censors and the audience, it could just as well be a cheerful samba or a loving tribute to Brazil, instead of a message of good-bye.²⁰ For this reason, the song's rhythm, melody and lyrical

20. VELOSO, Caetano. *Verdade tropical*. São Paulo, Editora Companhia das Letras, 2008, pp. 418-419.

structure resemble a happy carnival samba. As for the textual content, the lyrics of the song are a salute to Rio de Janeiro, a 'hello', «alô,» by a Sonic I who returns, after his «travels around the world,» to his beloved city with its urban spaces, its habits and its characters. At different levels, a tension between contradictory situations is thus created: the narrative of the Sonic I tells the inverse story of what the author is about to experience and the sound of the song triggers a celebratory response from the audience that contrasts with the sad circumstances under which the song was written. In this case, then, affect can be approached either as a space of resonance between the bodies of the narrator and the Sonic I or as an intensity in the performance that can trigger different emotional responses, depending on whether the listener is informed about the situation of the author, or not.

To start with the song as a performance: its affective character can be deduced from the song's emphasis on participation by the listener or the audience. The repeating chorus of «aquele abraço,» which in the refrain is alternated with the inserted lines of the artist or the Sonic I, functions as a question and answer structure that is easily picked up on even a first listening. Gilroy refers to this call and response structure of «antiphony» as one of the «principal formal feature[s] of [black] musical traditions» (78). Another affective aspect of the song resides in the danceable rhythm that invites the body (or a part of it: feet, hips, head, fingers) to move along to an upbeat rhythm. The listener or the audience therefore constitutes the affected body, the object to whom the performance is directed and which becomes part of the performance because it is touched by it. The combination of this rhythm, together with the uplifting sound of the major chords that the song consists of, is more likely to bring a smile to one's face than, for example, a melancholic minor tonality.²¹ The affective transmission through which the listener tunes into the cheerful character of the song and therefore aligns with the emotion that is being expressed, is what Van Alphen refers to as «entrainment.»²²

The concept of entrainment, denoting an alignment of emotions, can also be approached from a musicological perspective. A technical definition of musical entrainment is given by Clayton, Sager and Will, who describe it as «two rhythmic processes [that] interact with each other in such a way that they adjust towards and eventually 'lock in' to a common phase and/or periodicity.»²³ They also stress the difference between entrainment and resonance. Entrainment is composed of

21. CROWDER, Robert G. «Perception of the major/minor distinction: III. Hedonic, musical, and affective discriminations.» *Bulletin of the Psychonomic Society* 23 / 24 (1985), pp. 314-316. The question why major tonalities are related to positive emotions and minor has more negative connotations still lacks a clear, uniform answer. In the context of psychoacoustic studies, two possible arguments are given by Marianna Pinchot Kastner and Robert Crowder as a part of their experiments with major/minor perception by young children. The first argument follows the theory by the physicist Hermann von Helmholtz, who argues that the minor tonal spectrum, because of its complex frequency relations because of smaller intervals in its harmonic configurations, is more prone to cause an effect of roughness for the listener, hence an association of negativity. The other argument, following Crowder's theory, suggests that the response is culturally induced, as most of children's lullabies are sung in major tonalities. The higher level of familiarity with these tonalities therefore trigger more positive responses.

22. ALPHEN, Ernst van: *op. cit.* p. 25.

23. CLAYTON, Martin, Rebecca Sager, and Udo Will: «In time with the music: The concept of entrainment and its significance for ethnomusicology.» *European meetings in ethnomusicology*, 11 (2005), pp. 3-142 (3).

a combination between two or more autonomous oscillators whose rhythmic processes (oscillations) are not dependent on interaction. The difference from resonance is that resonance does not consist of two autonomously active components, as becomes clear from the example of a resonance box that stops producing sound once the tuning fork is removed from it.²⁴ Resonance, from the author's perspective, therefore needs an empty receiver, whereas entrainment implies two actors that eventually synchronize their movements. If brought to bear on resonance as equivalent to affect in the current analysis, this concept of resonance could create an image of affect as a passive process. Entrainment, then, would seem to be a more appropriate concept. However, I want to argue that affect is neither the one nor the other (from a musicological perspective, that is), but that it brings together key elements of both concepts. In the following, therefore, my use of resonance to clarify the workings of affect, specifically in music, also includes the characteristic of autonomy taken from the concept of entrainment.

Returning to the performance of «Aquele abraço,» the effect of the audience's happy response to the cheerful carnival-rhythm is not based on an effect of affect that can be linked to the above description of resonance, where the audience functions as an empty vessel. The reason is that the performance of «Aquele abraço» as a samba composition was performed in Brazil, where most of the cheerful responses mentioned above are likely to have been culturally induced – at least for a large part of the audience. In other words, the results of its affective operations are structured by cultural memory. A samba performance in Brazil is supposed to be a happy celebration where people are expected to smile, dance and sing along. The audience also takes an active part when it comes to translating affect to an emotional response, by situating it within a cognitive structure. The audience, therefore, functions as an autonomous «oscillatory system» that also partly conditions the other system as they oscillate together and tune into one another. The exchange is affective in the sense that it involves two bodies that not only act, but that are also being acted upon, in reciprocal fashion.

By now it is clear that although «Aquele abraço» might have been perceived as a happy song, it is more than that. Whilst the carnival resemblance is probably one of the reasons why neither the censors nor probably most of the audience picked up on the sad reason for the song, this does not fully undo its melancholic undertone. Melancholy, however, can probably only be felt (or, in other words, experienced as an effect of affect) if the story behind the song's existence is known by the listener. Both types of responses, be they induced by cultural memory or by knowledge about the reality behind the song's narrative, show that emotions are triggered by affect, but are not directly connected to it. The effects are structured by culture or by cognitive processes, not just by affect itself. Considering affect as resonance, from this perspective, does not imply that its objects function as empty vessels in reaction to a dominant, active subject or oscillatory system. Resonance is rather the affective connection between two (or more) bodies that are not necessarily

24. CLAYTON, Martin, Rebecca Sager, and Udo Will: *op. cit.* pp. 3-4.

aligned emotionally. The link with entrainment, therefore, is that affect relates to the connection between two or more bodies, where these bodies trigger a (rhythmic) change in each other – which, in the human body, leads to an emotional perception of that change – without necessarily synchronizing emotionally. They tune into one another through the resonance of affect, which itself is still empty of emotional definition.

Focusing on the performance of «Aquele abraço,» a contrast between the song's performance (the happy carnival) and its performative aspect (the melancholic goodbye to one's country) can be observed. In the performance, the author play-acts a happy carnivalesque samba, whereas on the performative level he is actually saying goodbye to his country. For the spectator, however, the performance does not contradict the performative unless Gil's story behind the song is known. In this case, affect can be recognized by its results, which are mediated by the (linear) narrative of the facts that are available to the spectator. Either cultural memory is likely to trigger a cheerful response to the samba, or the immanent goodbye to the homeland behind the samba will cause a melancholic reception. As seen above, the emotional response is set in motion by affect, but the translation into a particular emotion is defined by a particular narrative.

At the same time, the cheerful samba can also be a performative expression of love towards the homeland, caused by the affectively diasporic experience of the author. The imminence of his departure already induces him to being capable of perceiving the homeland retrospectively, before actually departing. One could then argue that the author, through the Sonic I, is performing his role as a diasporic subject. Performance in this case is not mediated by memory, as the memorization of a text or score, but by a projection of the future as an inversed memory. What this observation suggests is that affect can also resonate between narratives. In this case, between the narrative of the Sonic I and the author, where one narrative is not dominant over the other because of different narrative levels of authority. Instead, the discussion above has indicated that the author as a body can just as well be impinged by the Sonic I of his or her own narration. Here, my analysis adds an important point to Massumi who states the following about the difference in character between intensity and narrative:

Intensity would seem to be associated with nonlinear processes: resonation and feedback which momentarily suspend the linear progress of the narrative present from past to future.²⁵

As argued in the analysis above, the affective resonance between different narratives therefore also makes it possible to perceive a non-linear potentiality in the narrative.²⁶

25. MASSUMI, Brian. *op. cit.* p. 86.

26. Also see MÜHLHOFF, Rainer: «Affective Resonance and Social Interaction.» *Phenomenology and the Cognitive Sciences* (2014): 1-19. Although my concept of *affective resonance* coincides with the concept from psychological theory used by Mühlhoff, they are not identical. Our theories partly converge in that they draw on the premise of a reciprocal influence between different oscillatory sources that can either be physical elements (such as vibrating guitar strings) or social actors. But where I focus on the narrative implications of the concept from a primarily musical

The idea of resonance is, once again, best explained when related to music. In *A Thousand Plateaus*, Deleuze and Guattari refer to the same image of non-linear dynamics when they explain the difference between memory and becoming. According to their theory, where they state that «becoming is an antimemory,» they refer to music in order to explain the difference between memory as a linear system and becoming as the non-linear forming of blocks:

Musical representation, on the one hand, draws a horizontal, melodic line, the bass line, upon which other melodic lines are superposed [...]. On the other hand, it draws a vertical, harmonic line or plane, which moves along the horizontals but is no longer dependent upon them; it runs from high to low and defines a chord capable of linking up with the following chords.²⁷

In this image of musical notation, harmonics is used to show how the (vertically arranged) consonant relation between different notes in a chord proceeds to other chords in a movement that is not dependent on the way in which the musical theme moves on, but that works according to an auditory logic instead. When we connect this to the discussion above, it suggests that the combination of the narrative of the Sonic I who returns to the homeland with the story of the author/artist who is yet to leave creates a vertical resonance between two apparently separate worlds. This resonance creates an alternative narration that, in nuance to Massumi's characterization, does proceed along a horizontal axe, to stick to Deleuze's and Guattari's terminology, but according to different rules: what makes the narrative of the author and that of the Sonic I interact is not to be found within the logic of their separate narrations, but in the affective resonance between both.

The way of reading this interaction of narratives is to approach it indirectly, through the relation of proximity by which apparently separated worlds affect each other through a resonance, a vertical instead of a horizontal one: affective diaspora.²⁸ The Sonic I of «Aquele abraço» narrates a return to the homeland whereas the author who speaks through this Sonic I has not yet left the country. In other words, the author is capable of performing this imagined return because he is affected by the imminence of his own departure, which, in a non-chronological, non-linear narrative allows him to give an account of his own return, through the eyes and the voice of the Sonic I, from an outsider's perspective, or, stated differently, from the perspective of the returning traveller. This affectively diasporic experience is captured in the stanzas «Meu caminho pelo mundo eu mesmo traço / Bahia já me deu régua e compasso,» which can be translated as «I draw my own travels around the world / Bahia already gave me a ruler and a compass.»

perspective, Mühlhoff approaches the social dimensions of the concept from a philosophical and psychological point of view.

27. DELEUZE, Gilles and Félix Guattari: *A Thousand Plateaus*. 1980. London, Continuum. 2004, pp. 324 - 325.

28. My use of the expression «relation of proximity» could be misinterpreted as a statement that affective diaspora is only metaphorically present in the narration. This is not the case. Affective diaspora refers to an actual experience of the author, into which the song offers an artistically colored insight. The *relation* between the actual experience and the way in which the narrative works, however, is metaphorical in the sense that one can be read analogously to the other.

The Sonic I says that he «draws» his «travels around the world,» as if he were marking his itineraries on a world map. The remark that Bahia provided him with the measuring tools (ruler and compass) to draw out these itineraries suggests that Bahia predetermines the routes taken by the Sonic I. The starting point and final destination of the Sonic I's travels, however, is not Bahia but Rio de Janeiro, which the Sonic I perceives as «still beautiful.» This observation only makes sense if the Sonic I already feels a distance towards the city even though he has not yet left it. At the same time, it refers to an experience that he can only have upon his return after a physical separation of a certain period of time. The itinerary he draws around the world, therefore, is a travel that is both a departure and a return, or neither. The fact that the Sonic I is capable of perceiving Rio de Janeiro as «still beautiful» even before his departure implies that the outside world is already inscribed in the city as it is in the present. By the same token, the implied future return is not a homecoming to a fixed place of origin. Bahia, as the element that provides the Sonic I with the measuring tools to draw his travels around the world, always already invests the traveller with an irremediable experience of foreignness. The lyrics emphasize the way in which Bahia pervades the outside world through the travels of the Sonic I: «I draw my own travels around the world / Bahia already gave me a ruler and a compass.» In these verses, a second possible translation of the word «traço,» related to the verb «traçar,» is suggested, in which it becomes «trace» (Oxford Dictionaries). This translation suggests that the lines drawn on the world map by the Sonic I are also a trace, referring both to the trace Bahia has left in him and the trace he is now leaving, through it, on the outside world.

Significantly, the reference to Bahia creates a direct link with Gil's personal life, as it is his place of birth. Situated on the east-coast, Bahia was not only an important point of arrival and dispatching of African slaves in Brazil, but also a region with a large slave population due to the extensive amount of sugar plantations.²⁹ After the abolition of slavery, Bahia remained the primary area of settlement of African descendants, which resulted in the region's being known, until the present day, for the vividness of its African artistic, culinary and religious traditions. Gil's reference to Bahia is therefore not a mere invocation of his place of birth, but to his inheritance of the African diaspora as a descendant of the African slaves from Bahia. Returning to the analysis above, I mentioned that the Sonic I, at his return, also introduced part of the outside world into the homeland. The current interpretation of the lyrics suggests, in addition, that the inverse movement also takes place: the outward travel introduces the homeland into the external world in the form of a referential framework through which the journey is experienced. More importantly, however, it also shows that the homeland was already pervaded by the outside world before the Sonic I began his travels, due to the African diaspora. The Bahian inheritance of the «ruler and the compass» will therefore inevitably

29. SCHWARTZ, Stuart B.: *Sugar plantations in the formation of Brazilian society: Bahia, 1550-1835*. Cambridge, Cambridge University Press, 1985. This book is an influential historical work for further reading on slavery and the sugar plantations with a particular focus on Bahia.

lead the Sonic I along the old routes of the slave trade, following the traces of his inheritance, be it at his departure or his return: the affective character of his diasporic experience thus resonates in both directions.

There is also another way of translating the word «compasso,» which the Sonic I mentions as one of the things that was given to him by Bahia. Carnival, as an important element of the African legacy that is kept alive in Bahia, is characterized by group processions in the streets during its annual celebration: the marches of the so-called *blocos*.³⁰ Because «Aquele abraço» is an interpretation of a carnival song, the *compasso* as the Bahian inheritance of the Sonic I can therefore also allude to «compass» in the sense of the Latin contraction between *com-* (together) and *passus* (step) which means «keeping step in a march.»³¹ Although this other possible meaning of compass is still mentioned in combination with a measuring device, «*régua e compasso*,» it adds a possible affective dimension to the Sonic I's inherited diasporic itinerary. This alternative reading also makes it possible to read «*régua*» as an allusion to «ruler» in a musical way, where it could refer to «measure,» the horizontal divide of music as a progression along a notebar. This refers back to the quote from Deleuze and Guattari earlier, in which the horizontal progression and vertical harmony of musical notation are no longer dependent on one another, but can nonetheless resonate with another. The itinerary that the Sonic I draws with the help of the «*régua and compasso*» as musical measuring tools is therefore more than just a linear progression. It is also a movement that leaves traces by connecting worlds and bodies on the affective level, causing them to resonate with each other.

In other words, instead of being guided by a device that points only in one direction and that has to be interpreted with the intellect in order to keep a steady direction, the rhythmic, affective compass as guidance works on the body of the Sonic I and is unidirectional in its quality of resonance. The compass is therefore an *allusion* to how the outer world was already working through the body of the Sonic I since his birth, how it will continue to do so during his absence from the homeland, but also how the imminence of departure, which resonates with the author instead of the Sonic I, has already caused a change in his bodily perception through affect.

I have emphasized the word «allusion» above, in order to stress how its affective character takes it beyond the status of metaphor. Mieke Bal has argued for the use of allusion over metaphor because it is more true to the relation of proximity between an object and that what it refers to. Also, it does not replace one meaning by another in the way a metaphor does, but includes the latter meaning in the former:

30. BUTLER, Kim D.: *Freedoms given, freedoms won: Afro-Brazilians in post-abolition, Sao Paulo and Salvador*. New York, Rutgers University Press, 1998. In this book Butler elaborates on the double function of Carnival in Brazil as both a tradition that kept the African inheritance alive and a festivity that, for political reasons, also became a platform to reaffirm modernity in Brazil. Here she also discusses how the creation of Carnival clubs that set out to revive their African inheritance, had to deal with state interference based on prejudices.

31. OED Online: *Oxford English Dictionary*. Oxford University Press, June 2015. Web. 22 July 2015. www.oed.com

Allusions, as distinct from metaphors, are small and unobtrusive, and yet 'in touch with' what they allude to; they preclude collapsing meanings, but they also preclude distance.³²

Because allusions, according to Bal, suggest a message, through the mediation of an image, «by affect, and not by the poor logic of persuasion», the function of the compass in Gil's sonic narrative is not only a reference to the inclusion of the outside world in the body of the Sonic I, but also affectively includes the outside world into this image.³³

Back to Gilroy. At the start of this text I mentioned his recourse to musical examples in order to argue for the necessity of an affective approach towards cultural expressions that are marked by diaspora and repression. Music, from this perspective, is a form of expression that not only works through discourse in order to be apprehended by the intellect, but also resonates affectively at the level of the body, a resonance that can be understood only by what its (bodily) effects are or by how it is mobilized through the performance. Moreover, apart from what it is able to do at the level of the affective, it also represents how affect works. Gilroy uses the example of a song that circulates between America, Europe and the Caribbean, where the African origins of the composition are being re-interpreted with every new recording of the song, to show how diaspora does not consist of a «one-way flow of [African] culture from east to west.»³⁴ Instead, diaspora works affectively, in all directions, changing and being changed by all the bodies that it touches. How this works becomes clear in the above analysis of «Aquele abraço,» where the African diaspora of the slaves is seen to affect the culture of Bahia, which is seen to affect the perception of the world of the Sonic I and simultaneously his imminent departure and fictive return. In the words of Gilroy:

The very least which [...] music and its history can offer us today is an analogy for comprehending the lines of affiliation and association which take the idea of the diaspora beyond its symbolic status as the fragmentary opposite of some imputed racial essence.³⁵

These «lines of affiliation and association,» reminiscent of the ideas exposed in the earlier quotes of Massumi and Deleuze, are not based on a horizontal connection between notes, geographies or bodies, but allude to the vertical resonance that destabilizes the position of notes or bodies as a fixed point within a horizontal progression of melodies, narratives or diasporic trajectories. In a similar fashion, affective diaspora alludes to the experience of bodies that resonate with each other on both sides of apparently separated realms, destabilizing them both. No longer are they part of a horizontal progression within a single melody, narrative, discourse or nation; instead, they are traversed vertically, pervaded by parallel narratives and discourses, affectively resonating with other bodies.

32. BAL, Mieke: «Response: Ariel Dorfman's quest for responsibility.» *The Art Bulletin* 91.1 (2009), pp. 44-50 (47).

33. BAL, Mieke: *op. cit.* p. 47.

34. GILROY, Paul: *op.cit.* p. 96.

35. GILROY, Paul: *op.cit.* p. 95.

FINAL THOUGHTS

What the image of the *abraço*, the embrace from Gil's song, can teach us at this point is that affective resonance makes it possible for bodies to touch each other in a way that does not proceed through direct skin contact. Resonance travels through sound waves and can literally impinge on the body through these vibrations. Depending on the frequency and the volume of the receiving body, a sound can either be heard by the resonance it causes in the eardrums, or felt directly as a vibration on the skin.³⁶ Its potentiality of touch is therefore multiple, even if the receiving body tends to translate it into a singular experience, similar to the way affect is translated into emotion. The *abraço* in Gil's song exceeds the potential of a normal embrace between two people, because it is capable of touching different types of bodies at the same time. In fact, the song itself functions as an all-encompassing embrace of Rio de Janeiro, comprising the «Realengo» neighborhood of the military headquarters, the «girl from the favela,» Chacrinha the «old clown» and «all Brazilians.» The embrace is affective in the sense that it is multidirectional, making it capable, like resonance, of touching all the entities that are mentioned in the song at the same time.

But the allusion to the embrace is also multiple in character. As observed earlier, the embrace implies both a reunification of the Sonic I with his homeland and a goodbye to it; both the conclusion of an approaching movement between bodies and the starting point of a movement of separation. The Sonic I does not merely celebrate all the beauty he recognizes in the city, but also embraces the neighborhood that represents Gil's incarceration by the military. By the end of the song he even gives an embrace «to you who has forgotten me» which, in contrast with the gesture of recognition between two old friends that meet again, evokes the image of the embrace as resisting oblivion, of reinstating one's presence and reaffirming one's existence through the act of touch.

Ultimately, the embrace is also a simultaneous opening and closing; opening oneself up to another body in order to affect or be affected by it, and at the same time the closing of one's arms around another body, creating a new multiple unity of two bodies that separate themselves from a larger whole. In «Aquele abraço» the opening up of the embrace connects the Sonic I to the rest of the world, but at the same time the rest of this world is kept at a distance by the «*régua e compasso*» that Bahia gave him and that reduced the randomness of his «travels around the world» to the repetition of the trajectory he inherited from his ancestors. The movement of Gil's music is therefore multidirectional, simultaneously moving inward and outward, progressing into an outer world whilst at the same time circling back to

36. GOODMAN, Steve: *Sonic Warfare: Sound, Affect, and the Ecology of Fear*. Cambridge, MIT Press, 2010, p. 109. In this work Goodman approaches the concept of affect and its psychological and physical effects on bodies. In doing so, he creates a relation between sound art and music culture on the one hand, and acoustic weaponry in modern warfare on the other. As a way of demonstrating the physical effects that can be caused by resonance, he refers to a U.S. Army report about a «vortex ring generator,» a «nonlethal» acoustic weapon that is used to disperse big crowds by causing a bodily impact on targeted individuals. The weapon does so by emitting «concussion pulses at frequencies near the resonance of human body parts.»

where it came from. Any attempt to define this movement by either of its tendencies would mean censoring music's affective potential. The challenge is therefore to analyze music's textual and sonic narratives without reducing them to unidirectional, linear arguments, by reading into the simultaneousness of their antagonistic movements. In other words, where the object of analysis operates through affect, this object should be approached on its own terms, affectively.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

- ALPHEN, Ernst van: «Affective operations of art and literature.» *Res* 53 / 54 (2008), pp. 20-30.
- BAL, Mieke: «Response: Ariel Dorfman's quest for responsibility.» *The Art Bulletin* 91.1 (2009), pp. 44-50.
- BUTLER, Kim D.: *Freedoms Given, Freedoms Won: Afro-Brazilians in Post-Abolition, Sao Paulo and Salvador*. New York, Rutgers University Press, 1998.
- CAMBRAIA NAVES, Santuza: *Da Bossa Nova à Tropicália*. Rio de Janeiro, Jorge Zahar, 2001.
- CLAYTON, Martin, Rebecca Sager, and Udo Will: «In Time with the Music: The Concept of Entrainment and its Significance for Ethnomusicology.» *European Meetings in Ethnomusicology* 11 (2005), pp. 3-142.
- CROWDER, Robert G. «Perception of the Major/Minor Distinction: III. Hedonic, Musical, and Affective Discriminations.» *Bulletin of the Psychonomic Society* 23 / 24 (1985), pp. 314-316.
- DELEUZE, Gilles and GUATTARI, Félix: *A Thousand Plateaus*. 1980. London, Continuum, 2004.
- Do Couto, Bruno Gontyjo: «Em busca de uma modernidade nacional: o movimento modernista e o projeto político-cultural do regime Vargas.» *Latitude* 9.1 (2015), pp. 131-168.
- GIL, Gilberto: «Aquele abraço.» *Gilberto Gil*. Rio de Janeiro, Philips Records, 1969. LP.
- GILROY, Paul: *The Black Atlantic: Modernity and Double Consciousness*. London, Verso, 1993.
- GLISSANT, Edouard: «Creolization in the Making of the Americas.» *Caribbean Quarterly* (2008), pp. 81-89.
- GOODMAN, Steve: *Sonic Warfare: Sound, Affect, and the Ecology of Fear*. Cambridge, MIT Press, 2010.
- GRÄBNER, Cornelia: «Off the Page and Off the Stage: The Performance Poetry and its Public Function.» Diss. University of Amsterdam, 2007.
- GREGG, Melissa, and Gregory J. SEIGWORTH (Eds.): *The Affect Theory Reader*. Durham, Duke University Press, 2010.
- HALL, Stuart: «Cultural Identity and Diaspora.» *Identity: Community, Culture, Difference*. London: Lawrence & Wishart (1990), pp. 222-237.
- LARGE, Edward W.: «Resonating to Musical Rhythm: Theory and Experiment.» *The Psychology of Time* (2008), pp. 189-232.
- MASSUMI, Brian. «The Autonomy of Affect.» *Cultural Critique* (1995), pp. 83-109.
- MÜHLHOFF, Rainer: «Affective Resonance and Social Interaction.» *Phenomenology and the Cognitive Sciences* (2014): 1-19.
- OED Online: *Oxford English Dictionary*. Oxford University Press. Web. <www.oed.com>
Oxford Dictionaries. Portuguese - English. Web. <www.oxforddictionaries.com/pt>.
- SCHWARTZ, Stuart B.: *Sugar Plantations in the Formation of Brazilian Society: Bahia, 1550-1835*. Cambridge, Cambridge University Press, 1985.
- SEDGWICK, Eve Kosofsky, and Adam Frank: «Shame in the Cybernetic Fold: Reading Silvan Tomkins.» *Critical Inquiry* (1995), pp. 496-522.
- TREECE, David; González, Mike: *The Gathering of Voices*. London & New York, Verso, 1992.
- VELOSO, Caetano. *Verdade tropical*. São Paulo, Editora Companhia das Letras, 2008.



ESPACIO, TIEMPO Y FORMA

UNED

SERIE VII HISTORIA DEL ARTE

REVISTA DE LA FACULTAD DE GEOGRAFÍA E HISTORIA

Dossier by Mieke Bal: *Art Moves: Performativity in Time, Space and Form / El Arte (Se) Mueve: Performatividad en el Tiempo, el Espacio y la Forma* por Mieke Bal

15 MIEKE BAL (GUEST EDITOR)
Movement and the Still Image / El movimiento y la imagen fija

First reflections on movement

45 MIGUEL ÁNGEL HERNÁNDEZ NAVARRO
Retorcer el tiempo: Fernando Bryce y el arte de historia / Twisting Time: Fernando Bryce's Art of History

71 NANNA VERHOEFF
Surface Explorations: 3D Moving Images as Cartographies of Time / Exploraciones de superficie: Imágenes 3D en movimiento como cartografías del tiempo

93 RAMÓN SALAS LAMAMIÉ DE CLAIRAC
El tiempo dialéctico: la cuarta era de la imagen / Dialectical Time: The Fourth Era of the Image

117 MAR GARCÍA RANEDO
Desplazamientos (in)móviles / (Im)mobile Displacements

Technique: «mistakes» as movement

143 JOSE MANUEL GARCIA PERERA
El movimiento como simulacro en el mundo virtual: Michael Betancourt y el arte de la inmediatez / Movement as Simulacrum in the Virtual World: Michael Betancourt and the Art of Immediacy

159 ERNST VAN ALPHEN
Exoticism or the Translation of Cultural Difference / Exotismo o la traducción de la diferencia cultural

171 MÓNICA ALONSO RIVEIRO
Arqueología de la ausencia de Lucila Quieto: un viaje hacia la imagen imposible / Archaeology of Absence of Lucila Quieto: a Trip to the Impossible Image

193 AYLIN KURYEL
Disorienting Images: A Bust with Multiple Faces / Imágenes que desorientan: una instalación con múltiples caras

219 AMPARO SERRANO DE HARO
The Movement of Miracles / El movimiento de lo milagroso

Sharing space: discourses of display

235 ELISA DE SOUZA MARTÍNEZ
Ethnographic Image: In and Out of the Exhibition Space / La imagen etnográfica: dentro y fuera del espacio expositivo

261 NOA ROEI
Making National Heritage Move: Ilya Rabinovich's «Museutopia» Projects / Dinamizando el patrimonio nacional: el proyecto «Museutopia» de Ilya Rabinovich

279 FERNANDO DE FELIPE & IVÁN GÓMEZ
Cronoendoscopias: un viaje alucinante al interior del cuerpo humano / Chronoendoscopies: Imagining a Trip inside the Human Body

Being part of it: affect and the body

309 JEFFREY MANOEL PIJERS
Affective Resonance: The Moving Potential of Music in Gilberto Gil's «Aquele Abraço» / Resonancia afectiva: el potencial dinámico de la música en «Aquele Abraço» de Gilberto Gil

329 LAIA MANONELLES MONER
Micro-utopías de lo cotidiano, espacios de encuentro en el arte relacional: una aproximación a ciertas acciones de Marina Abramović y Tino Sehgal / Micro Utopias of the Quotidian, Meeting Spaces in Relational Art: An Approach to some Performances of Marina Abramović and Tino Sehgal

351 PATRICIA LIMIDO & HERVÉ REGNAUD
Les racines de l'œuvre : puissance émotionnelle et forme artistique. Deux exemples de land-art en France / Roots of Art: Emotional Impact and Artistic Form. Two Cases of Land-Art in France

373 CLARA LAGUILLO
Hibridación de medios en la confluencia de forma, tiempo y espacio: de la *Danse Serpentine* al *Capturing Dance* / Hybridization of Artistic Media on the Crossroad of Shape, Time and Space: From *Danse Serpentine* to *Capturing Dance*





ESPACIO, TIEMPO Y FORMA

Miscelánea · Miscellany

395 RAIMUNDO MORENO BLANCO
Aportaciones a la arquitectura y la historia del monasterio del Sancti Spiritus de Ávila / Contributions to the Architecture and History of the Monastery of Sancti Spiritus in Ávila

417 JOSÉ MANUEL ALMANSA MORENO
Estudio y recuperación de la Iglesia de San Lorenzo, Úbeda (Jaén) / Study and Recovery of the Church of San Lorenzo, Úbeda (Jaén)

459 MANUEL GIL DESCO
Imágenes de la locura en la Edad Moderna: escarnio y máscara en el discurso del poder / Images of Madness in the Modern Age: Derision and Mask in the Discourse of the Power

483 IGNACIO JOSÉ LÓPEZ HERNÁNDEZ
El Cuerpo de Ingenieros Militares y la Real Junta de Fomento de la isla de Cuba. Obras públicas entre 1832 y 1854 / Spanish Military Engineers and the Real Junta de Fomento at the Island of Cuba. Public Works between 1832 and 1834

509 NOELIA FERNÁNDEZ GARCÍA
La labor reconstructora de Francisco Somolinos en Langreo, Asturias: La iglesia parroquial de Santiago Apóstol / The Rebuilding Task of Francisco Somolinos in Langreo, Asturias: The Parish Church of Santiago Apostol

531 ROCÍO GARRIGA INAREJOS
Espacio resonantes: del paisaje sonoro de las trincheras a la escucha del silencio en Alfonso Reyes y John Cage / Resonant Spaces: From the Soundscapes of the Trenches to the Hearing of Silence in Alfonso Reyes and John Cage

Reseñas · Book Review

551 JOSE ANTONIO VIGARA ZAFRA
Vigo Trasanco, Alfredo: *La ciudad y la mirada del artista. Visiones desde el Atlántico*. Santiago de Compostela, Teófilo, 2014.

555 JESÚS ÁNGEL SÁNCHEZ GARCÍA
Alonso Pereira, José Ramón (dir.): *Modernidad y contemporaneidad en la arquitectura de Galicia*. Universidad de La Coruña, La Coruña, 2012.

559 JOAQUÍN MARTÍNEZ PINO
Gimeno, María y Collazos, Raquel (coord.): *Paradores de Turismo*. La colección artística. Madrid, Paradores de Turismo, Fundación Mapfre, 2015.